

**Status of
Implementation of Food Schemes in Uttar Pradesh**

A Report based on Field Survey in Four Districts

Submitted to

**Office of Commissioners of Supreme Court (CWP 196/2001)
(in the case PUCL vs. Union of India and ors.)**

Conducted by

**State Adviser to the Commissioners of the Supreme Court,
Uttar Pradesh**

Preface

The office of the Supreme Court Commissioners under the right to Food case (no196 of 2001) decided to conduct this study in order to assess implementation of food schemes in Uttar Pradesh. In this context survey was undertaken for the 10th Report of the Commissioners to assess the grass root realities of food and social security schemes in the state. The focus is on the coverage, access, quality, problems and grievance redressal of Integrated Child Development Services, Indira Gandhi National old Age Pension Scheme, National Family Benefit Scheme, National Maternity Benefit Scheme, Targeted Public Distribution System and Mid day Meal. The study was conducted in four districts of four regional zones of Uttar Pradesh. They were Kushinagar district from Poorvanchal region, Badaun district from Western U.P, district Hardoi from Central U.P and district Lalitpur from Bundelkhand region. The findings of the study clearly points out to poor implementation of all the food security schemes across the regions and emphasizes the need and urgency for better planning and governance.

The study was not possible without guidance of Commissioners Dr N.C. Saxena and Shri Harsh Mander. Dipa Sinha, Biraj Patnaik and Sameet Panda from Commissioners office provided continuous support and commented and helped to write the report.

Government of Uttar Pradesh through its office of Chief Secretary Shri Atul Gupta helped us to get access to districts and his directive to concerned districts magistrates and departments helped us to get the field data and helped us in accommodation in field area. I must give special thanks to Dr Jacob Thomos (then) Principle Secretary of Food and Civil Supplies as our nodal officer for his excellent cooperation for the study.

As an Advisor I made effort to involve people's organizations who have contributed, strengthen and lead people's struggles for food security and justice over years in Uttar Pradesh. The field team of activists who worked tirelessly to make this study possible was drawn from these groups. They are Punit, Sampat and Meena from Vanagana, Santram from Dynamic Action Group, Mukesh,

Omprakash and Jaganath from Sangtin, Jaishankar from NAPM, Gangesh and Govind from Asha, Keshav and Sangita from Jagruk Lok Sanghtan, Brijesh from Gramya, Devendra from Parmarth, Arti from Sai Jyoti, Pawan from Kaimur Khestra Mahila Mazdoor Kisan Sanghrash Samiti and Mahendra from Lok Samiti. I owe them my humble gratitude. Dr Yogesh Bandhu who worked overtime as research assistant needs special thanks for painstakingly compiling all figures and classifying the data in its present form.

I hope this report will lead to enhancement of food security schemes in Uttar Pradesh.

Arundhati Dhuru

Advisor to the Supreme Court Commissioners for Uttar Pradesh

Lucknow

Introduction to the study

To address the unending chronic hunger in the country a PIL¹ was filed by PUCL Rajasthan in the Supreme Court of India under CWP-196/2001 which is popularly known as “Right to Food case”. In its interim verdicts Honorable Supreme Court appointed Commissioners to monitor the eight food related schemes declared as entitlements by the orders of the Supreme Court. As part of their responsibility the commissioners submit regular reports on the status of implementation of the food-related schemes to the apex court. The present study “Status of Implementation of food related schemes” was under taken to find out the functioning of food related schemes in ten states of India. The study will contribute to the 10th report of the Commissioners to be submitted to the Supreme Court of India.

The study was facilitated by the Uttar Pradesh State Advisor Ms. Arundhati Dhuru and her team. The preparation of questionnaires and training of researchers were undertaken by the Commissioners’ office.

Objective of the study

To access the implementation of food related schemes monitored by the Supreme Court of India under (CWP-196/2001) the right to food case. The survey covered the following aspects

- Coverage
- Availability, accessibility and quality
- Problems in implementation
- Grievance redressal mechanism and general grievances

The purpose of the study was to identify the present status of functioning of the schemes in four districts of Uttar Pradesh.

Methodology

The study was conducted in four districts of Uttar Pradesh – Badaun, Hardoi, Kushinagar and Lalitpur. The districts were selected based on their geographical location to represent different regions in the state. Two blocks were selected from each district – one relatively forward block and the second one being one of the

¹ Visit www.righttofoodindia.org to know detail about the PIL

remote blocks of the district. The selection of the district and block was done by the State Advisor and the villages were selected by the Commissioners' office. From the Census list of villages, five villages were randomly selected from each block. Of the total 10 villages selected in each district it was ensured that at least one had a SC population in the range of 20% to 50% and that at least one other village had a population of minorities (Muslims, Christians) or PTGs.

Since the survey covered all the eight schemes that are covered under the Supreme Court case, the village rather than households were taken as the sample for the major schemes such as ICDS, MDM and PDS. Therefore data was collected from all the anganwadi centres (AWCs) and the schools to assess the functioning of the ICDS and MDM schemes respectively. The survey team spoke to both the service providers and the beneficiaries. The ration shop was visited and ration dealer interviewed for information on the TPDS and AAY. On the other hand for schemes that are based on cash payments to individuals, such as NOAPS, NFBS and NMBS, the homes of all BPL families were visited and every eligible beneficiary in the village was administered a simple questionnaire. Further, focus group discussions (FGDs) were held in all the villages to get community responses on the functioning of all the schemes. Care was taken to ensure that the FGDs included members from vulnerable communities and women. In villages, where it was felt that one FGD could not capture the voices of the different sections, more than one FGD was conducted.

The following sections present the main findings of the survey, for each scheme, in the state of Uttar Pradesh

Integrated Child Development Services (ICDS) Scheme

Sample covered under the survey

To find out the status of implementation of the scheme survey was carried out in total 39 villages - 10 villages each in Badaun, Hardoi and Kushinagar districts and 9 villages in Lalitpur district. In the 39 villages, 55 Anganwadi centers were visited and 43 Focus group discussions were conducted.

District	No. of Villages Covered	No. of AWC covered	No. of FGDs conducted where ICDS was discussed
Badaun	10	12	10
Hardoi	10	14	14
Lalitpur	9	11	9
Kushinagar	10	18	10
Total	39	55	43

Infrastructure facility at the Anganwadi center

Districts	Anganwadis housed in government buildings		Number of anganwadis in		
	Number	Percent	Pakka	Kachha	Semi-Pakka
Badaun	11	91.67	11	0	0
Hardoi	6	42.85	11	1	2
Lalitpur	10	90.9	11	0	0
Kushinagar	3	16.66	10	1	7
Total	30	54.55	43	2	9

In the 39 survey villages out of 55 AWCs, 30 centers are housed in government building which is about of half of the Anganwadi centers surveyed. There are 43 AWCs based in Pakka buildings, 2 centers are housed in Kachha building and 9 centers in semi pakka house.

Basic facilities at the AWCs

For an anganwadi center to function properly it needs some basic facilities and amenities at the center. The basic amenities include weighing scale, toys, medicine kit etc, and the basic facilities includes drinking water facilities, cooking space and toilet.

The weighing is one of the most important equipment required at the centers. The worker is required to take the weight of the children at a monthly basis which helps her to know the growth of the child and support is provided when some child is undernourished. As per the survey only in 20 (37.04%) centers weighing scale is available and all of them are in a functional stage. The worst situation is in Hardoi district where none of the centre has a weighing scale. It shows most of the centres can't ascertain the nutrition status of the children and mother who are enrolled in the center.

Facilities	Available		Functional	
	Number	Percent	Number	Percent
Weighing scale for children				
Badaun	7	63.64	7	63.64
Hardoi	0	0	0	0
Lalitpur	9	81.82	9	81.82
Kushinagar	4	22.22	4	21.22
Total	20	37.04	20	37.04
Toys for children				
Badaun	11	100	11	100
Hardoi	4	28.57	4	28.57
Lalitpur	7	63.64	7	63.64
Kushinagar	7	38.89	7	38.89
Total	29	53.7	29	53.7
Medicine Kit				
Badaun	11	100	11	100
Hardoi	0	0	0	0
Lalitpur	8	72.73	8	72.73
Kushinagar	7	38.89	7	38.89
Total	26	48.15	26	48.15
Drinking Water				
Badaun	10	90.91	10	90.91
Hardoi	9	64.29	9	64.29
Lalitpur	5	45.45	5	45.45
Kushinagar	13	72.22	13	72.22
Total	37	68.52	37	68.52
Cooking facilities				
Badaun	2	18.18	2	18.18
Hardoi	2	14.29	2	14.29
Lalitpur	4	36.36	4	36.36
Kushinagar	0	0	0	0
Total	8	14.81	8	14.81
Toilet Facilities				
Badaun	9	81.82	9	81.82
Hardoi	3	21.43	3	21.43
Lalitpur	1	9.09	1	9.09
Kushinagar	2	11.11	2	11.11
Total	15	27.78	15	27.78

Only 29 centers had toys available at the center, which is 53 percent of the total centers surveyed. However all the centers in the Baduan district have toys available for the kids at the center.

All the centers should keep few basic medicine for fever, cold cough etc. it is mostly provided as a medicine kit. In the case as well half of the center (26) does not have medicine kit and in the Hardoi district none of the center has medicine kit available at the center; however all the center in the Badaun district has medicine kit readily available.

Total 37 centers (68.52%) have drinking water facility available in the center itself. It is also highest in the Badaun district where almost 90 percent of the centers have availability of drinking water facility.

The Supreme Court has ordered that children in the age group of three to six years must be provided with hot cooked meals at the anganwadi centres. For this, all the centers should have cooking facilities in the center itself. However only in 8 centers (14.81%) have cooking facilities available in the center. In case of Kushinagar district none of the center has any cooking facility.

Out of 55 AWCs surveyed only 15 centers (27.78%) have functional toilet, it is lowest in case of Lalitpur district where only one center (9.09%) has functional toilet.

Preschool activities at the AWCs

Pre-school for the three-to six years old children in the Anganwadi is directed towards providing and ensuring a natural, joyful and stimulating environment, with emphasis on necessary inputs for optimal growth and development. The early learning component of the ICDS is a significant input for providing a sound foundation for cumulative lifelong learning and development. It also contributes to the universalisation of primary education, by providing the child the necessary preparation for primary schooling and offering substitute care to younger siblings, thus freeing the older ones – especially girls – to attend school.

Non formal pre-school is an important component of the ICDS Scheme which covers the children in the age group of three to six years. Pre-school education is conducted in the Anganwadi Centre with the pre-school kit, colorful wall paintings and through play methods. For organising the pre-school Anganwadi Workers are supposed to undertake four months training.

As per the survey average number of children present during the center visit is 9.78. It is highest in case of

District	Average Number of children present during visit	Av. no. of children attending pre-school as per FGD	Number of centres where pre-school activities were being conducted during visit		Number of centres where pre-school activities are conducted regularly as per FGD	
			Number	Percent	Number	Percent
Badaun	11.5	11	2	16.67	0	0
Hardoi	12.2	7	1	7.14	0	0
Lalitpur	5.82	4	0	0	0	0
Kushinagar	9.6	11	0	0	0	0
Total	9.78	8	3	5.45	0	0

Hardoi district. However as per the focus group discussion held in the villages“ average number of children attending preschool is 8. In only 3 centers preschool activities were being conducted during the visit which is mere 5 percent of the total centers surveyed. In Lalitpur and Kushinagar districts in none of the centers preschool activities were being conducted during the visit. It came out from the FGDs that none of the centers conduct preschool activities.

Coverage of children

All the children under the age of six are covered under supplementary nutrition programme (SNP). Dry ration is provided to all children 0-3 year“ s age group and hot cooked food is provided to the children within 3-6 years of age. As per the SNP register of all the 55 AWCs surveyed average number of children enrolled for SNP is 122. It is highest in case of Badaun district.

District	Average no. f children enrolled for SNP
Badaun	151.25
Hardoi	115.35
Lalitpur	111.45
Kushinagar	110.44
Total	122.12

Caste discrimination

In India caste plays a major role in almost everything, even in the public services which is universal. During the survey it was found that out of 55 centers surveyed 42 are based housed in upper caste mohallas. The surveyors are of the view

District	Number of AWCs visited	Number of AWCs in upper caste mohallas	Number of AWCs equally accessible to all castes	No. of AWWs who belonged to SC/St communities
Badaun	12	11	4	2
Hardoi	14	10	0	4
Lalitpur	11	6	0	3
Kushinagar	18	15	7	6
Total	55	42	11	15

that only 11 of all the centers surveyed are equally accessible to all the caste group. Regarding

appointment of Anganwadi workers only 15 workers are from SC/ST communities which are mere 27.27 percent of all the workers.

Frequency of opening of AWCs

District	Average no. of days AWC was open in a month as per attendance register	Average no. of days AWC was open during the last month as per responses of the community
Badaun	22	16
Hardoi	9.5	9.5
Lalitpur	23	7.5
Kushinagar	10	15
Total	16	12

As per the guidelines the AWCs should open 25 days a month however as per the attendance register of the centers visited the AWCs opens average 16 days. It is as less as 9.5 days in the Hardoi district and highest 23 days in the Lalitpur district. If we go by the community response from the FGDs the average number days the AWCs opens is 12 days a month. However as per the FGDs it is lowest in case of Lalitpur district.

Supplementary Nutrition Programme

Category	Uncooked Daliya/ Panjiri	RTE mix	Dry rations (rice, dal, etc.)	Chana/peanuts	Cooked food (khichdi, etc.)	Other
under 3	42 (80 gms)	1	1	1	1	0
3-6 years	21	8	0	7	14	0
pregnant/ lactating mothers	45	0	8	2	0	0
adolescent girls	39	0	0	2	1	0

Pregnant and nursing mothers and children within the age group 6 months to 6 years are supposed to be provided with a supplementary nutrition support under the scheme for 300 days a year.

As told by the AWWs and the beneficiaries uncooked dalia is provided to most of under 3 children and pregnant and lactating women and also the adolescent girls. The 3-6 years age group children should be provided cooked food only however in 21 centers they are provided

uncooked dalia, at 8 centers RTE mix and 7 centers it is peanuts. Only at 14 centers cooked food is provided to the 3-6 years age group children which are clear violation of the order of Supreme Court.

Regularity in SNP

In mere 19 centers (34.55%) no disruption was reported in the last three month from the day of survey. The average number of days of disruption is 22.2 days it is highest in case of Kushinagar district it was 31.2 days. As per the FGDs only in 5 centers SNP was regular in the past three months before the survey. In case of Badaun and Lalitpur districts none of the center had regular distribution of SNP. The distribution is regular in 6 centers for the children under age group 3 to 6 years. However in none of the FGDs people were satisfied with the quality of food being provided in the centers.

District	Number of centres where AWW reported that SNP was distributed without disruption in the last 3 months		Av. No. of days of disruption according to AWW in centres where there was disruption	Responses from FGD		
	Number	Percent		No. of AWC where SNP for under 3 was regular in the last one month	No. of AWCs where SNP for 3 to 6 was regular in the last one month	No. of AWCs where quality of food was reported to be good
Badaun	5	41.67	12.6	0	1	0
Hardoi	2	14.29	15.4	2	2	0
Lalitpur	4	36.36	29.6	0	2	0
Kushinagar	8	44.44	31.2	3	1	0
Total	19	34.55	22.2	5	6	0

Growth monitoring at the centers

Each month the AWW is suppose to take weight of all the children enrolled in the center. It helps to find out the nutrition status of the children. They should communicate the weight of the child and its grade to the parents/mother of child.

Districts	Number of AWWs where children were weighed in the last three months according to AWW	Number of AWWs where grading was done in the last three months according to AWW	Number of AWCs where weighing was done in the last 3 months according to FGD	Number of centres where FGD participants said parents were informed about the growth monitoring
Badaun	3	0	1	0
Hardoi	2	1	0	0
Lalitpur	9	4	2	0
Kushinagar	2	1	1	0
Total	16	6	4	0

As per the AWC register in mere 16 centers children were weighed at the center and only in 6 centers grading was done. In such a case it is not possible to ascertain the nutrition status of the children. As per the FGDs weighing was undertaken in 4 centers only and none of the center did it in the Hardoi district. In none of the centers parents were informed regarding the growth monitoring of their children.

Health and nutrition counseling

All the anganwadi workers are required to hold regular monthly meeting of mothers to discuss about various relating to health, hygienic and growth of their children .The worker also has to make regular home visits of the beneficiaries. As per the survey, in none of the centers visited the worker holds monthly meetings or makes home visits. Only in 19 centers it was reported that

Districts	Anganwadi worker holds meetings for mothers	Anganwadi worker makes home visits	Anganwadi worker comes regularly
Badaun	0	0	5
Hardoi	0	0	6
Lalitpur	0	0	2
Kushinagar	0	0	6
Total	0	0	19

the workers comes to the center regularly. It is lowest in case of Lalitpur district only in 2 centers workers comes regularly to the center.

Disability

During the visit to the centers in only 6 centers the team could find a disabled child. The workers are supposed to undertake disability survey regularly. It was reported that only in 12 centers (21.8) disability survey was conducted in the last one year. In the 36 centers (65.45) it was never ever conducted.

Districts	Number of centers where any disabled children were present during the visit		Number of centers where disability survey was conducted in the last one year		Number of centers where disability survey was NEVER conducted	
	Number	Percent	Number	Percent	Number	Percent
Badaun	2	16.67	1	8.33	11	91.67
Hardoi	0	0	3	21.43	9	64.29
Lalitpur	0	0	3	27.27	8	72.73
Kushinagar	4	22.2	5	27.78	8	44.44
Total	6	10.91	12	21.82	36	65.45

Visit of the supervisors and health workers

District	Average no. of visits by supervisor per centre in the last 12 months	Average no. of visits by health worker per centre in the last 12 months
Badaun	1	0.5
Hardoi	3	3.5
Lalitpur	7	11
Kushinagar	3	0.2
Total	2.5	3.8

The role of Supervisor is very critical, as she provides on the job guidance to the AWW that bridges the gap between the training and job requirement. The Supervisor is supposed to visit every AWC once a month and she is supposed to stay a night in a far away AWC once every week. As per the survey average number of visits by the supervisor is 2.5 times in the last 12 months and it is 3.8 times by the health workers.

Findings and recommendations

The findings of the survey show that the ICDS scheme is not functioning at its optimal level in the state. In many places the anganwadi centres are being run only as feeding centers without preschool teaching, nutritional counseling, health education and other services. The infrastructure facilities are quite poor, also it lacks basic requirements like toys, medicine kits and toilets facilities etc. It was also seen that the distribution of SNP is not regular and the awareness level among the beneficiaries regarding the SNP is very low. The survey also reflects that the motivation level among the AWWs is quite low which is another reason the scheme is not able to perform upto its mark. The following are some recommendations for effective implementation of the scheme:

Recommendations

1. All the AWCs need to have their own pucca building with adequate infrastructural facilities like toilet, toys, weighing machine, medicine kit etc. The ICDS in UP fairing poor in these aspects as only 54% AWCs run in their own building, only 27.78% of them have a functional toilet , 14.81% have cooking facility and 48.15% AWCs have medicine kit. For effective implementation of ICDS in the state, putting the infrastructure in place would be highly recommended. Infrastructure includes, AWC building, playing, teaching and learning materials, adequate staff to ensure all services reaching all the beneficiaries. It is recommended that Govt. should take adequate measures, also fund is allocated to ensure basic infrastructure in place to provide the entitlements to the beneficiaries.
2. The Pre School was functioning in only 5.54% of all the AWCs surveyed and only 9 children in an average present during the survey. As non formal preschool education is one of the important services under ICDS scheme therefore regular preschool need to be ensured with regular super vision by the supervisors and CDPOs with strict instruction being issued to AWWs for regular opening up the center.
3. Location of the Anganwadi is important in terms of access of ST (PTG), SC and minorities. So new Anganwadis should be located in the community itself.
4. It is not sure whether all the SC and ST and minorities habitation has been covered under ICDS. It is advisable that as per the direction of the Supreme Court of India dated 13 December 2006, priority should be given to “Anganwadi on demand” to cover the SC and ST habitation in the state.

5. It has been reported that there is regular disruption of supply of food grain in more than 65 percent of the centers surveyed, it also came out that the average disruption is 22 days. The regular distribution of SNP at the centers need to be ensured with decentralize procurement and distribution of food grain without involvement of contactors.
6. The supply of the food grain to the beneficiaries should be regular and as per the stipulated amount.
7. More emphasis should be given to the capacity building of AWWs and AWHs. More importantly the Supervisors have to be more accountable to impart on-going monitoring and training to the AWW and AWH
8. Fund for managing AWC should be regular and rational. The fund meant for AWC towards condiments and fuel wood should be released on a monthly basis, and in case of delay the project and sector officials should be made accountable.
9. There is urgent need for awareness generation of the beneficiaries about their entitlements under ICDS.
10. The disabled children were almost invisible in the anganwadi centers during the survey. Only six disabled children was present in all 55 AWCs surveyed. As per the records disability survey was not undertaken 65% of all the centers. Therefore proper survey should be done at a regular basis to identify the children with disability as they are most vulnerable among all the children. The anganwadi workers should be motivated not only to identify and give them stipulated amount of SNP but also take initiative to make the disable children intermix and participate with other children.
11. There should be uniform and robust grievance redressal mechanism in place in the state. The complaints that are coming are either not attended or solved without any time frame. So web based grievance redressal mechanism along with toll free number at the district and state level would help in this regard. However, effort should be made to take the grievance redressal in public domain.

Targeted Public Distribution System

Sample Covered

To assess the implementation of food related scheme the team surveyed 39 villages under four district of the state. Out of 39 villages surveyed, 33 villages have ration shop in the village only. For rest of the six villages the nearest ration shop is less than 3 kilometer and for rest of the five villages it is more

District	No. of Villages Covered	Villages that have a ration shop within the same village		Number of villages where nearest ration shop is not in village	
		Number	Percent	<3kms away	<3kms away
Badaun	10	8	80	0	2
Hardoi	10	7	70	1	2
Lalitpur	10	9	90	0	1
Kushinagar	9	9	100	0	0
Total	39	33	84.61	1	5

than three kilometer from the respective village. In Kushinagar district all the surveyed villages have a ration shop in the village itself.

Distribution of ration cards

PDS is a scheme which provides subsidized items through fair price shops. The issuing of ration cards to holders gives them entitlement to obtain certain essential commodities, at a certain scale, at set prices through fair

District	Total number of households in the villages covered by the survey	Total number of APL cards	Total number of BPL cards	Total number of AAY cards
Badaun	3188	3072	492	297
Hardoi	3048	2697	1255	887
Lalitpur	2921	1814	672	453
Kushinagar	5879	1832	1411	865
Total	15036	9415	3830	2502

price shops. Three types of ration cards prevalent in the state such BPL, AAY and APL cards. As per the information provided by the government of UP number of APL card holder it is 32396781, for BPL- 6584500 and total AAY card distributed in the state is 4094500.

The majority of cards found in the survey villages are BPL card. However the finding shows that total numbers of cards distributed is more than number of card, the percentage of card distributed is 104 percent as compared to numbers of family covered under the survey.

Information publicly displayed on ration shop

According to the SC Orders on TPDS, the information on ration shop timings (specifying time and days the shop is open), prices at which food grains are disbursed, quotas or the amount of food grains received for the month and card holder details, (i.e. the number of APL, BPL & AAY cards) have to be publicly displayed in each fair price shop.

During the survey it was found that the norms set by the apex court have been violated blatantly.

Information display

Timing: only in 71 shops timing of functioning of ration shop has been mentioned which is 43.5 percent of the total shop surveyed. It is as less as 20 percent in the Hardoi district.

Price: it is also displayed in only 46 percent of the total shop and it is as less as 22 percent in Kushinagar district.

Quota: in 48.7% shops (19) allocation has been displayed; in Lalitpur district only in 20 percent district it is being displayed.

Card holder's details: total 23 shops have displayed card holders' detail which is 58.9 percent of the total card displayed. In Hardoi district only one ration shop displayed the card holder details.

Districts	Timings		Price		Quota		Card holder details	
	No	%	No	%	No	%	No	%
Badaun	6	60	9	90	8	80	9	90
Hardoi	2	20	3	30	6	60	1	10
Lalitpur	6	60	4	40	2	20	10	100
Kushinagar	3	33.3	2	22.2	3	33.3	3	33.3
Total	17	43.5	18	46.1	19	48.7	23	58.9

Food grain amount and prices issued to different categories in Uttar Pradesh

The price of food grain which is being distributed to different categories of carders is as follows.

Category	Amount of grain being allocated		Price in Rs per Kilogram
	9 divisions of east UP	8 divisions of west UP	
BPL	Wheat- 10 kg Rice – 25 kg	Wheat- 15 Rice – 20	4.65 6.15
AAY	Wheat- 10 kg Rice – 25 kg	Wheat- 15 Rice – 20	2.00 3.00
APL	Wheat- 10 kg Rice – 25 kg	Wheat- 15 Rice – 20	6.60 8.45

FGD response on card holding installment purchase and public scrutiny

District	No. of villages where ration dealers from same village		No. of villages where ration cards are usually kept with the households		No. of villages where ration can be bought in installments		No. of villages where someone asked for ration records and it was made available for public scrutiny	
	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
Badaun	6	60	10	100	0	0	0	0
Hardoi	7	70	11	78.57	0	0	0	0
Lalitpur	6	60	9	90.00	0	0	0	0
Kushinagar	9	100	8	88.89	1	11.1	1	11.1
Total	28	71.7	38	88.37	1	2.33	1	2.33

As per the survey 28 ration shop dealers (71.7%) are from the same village only. It was also found that in 38 villages, people said that families keep their ration cards with themselves which is 88.37 percent of the total villages surveyed.

As per the order of Supreme Court all the ration card holders are entitled to buy their ration in installments. However if we go by the survey only in one village of Kushinagar district it is possible for the beneficiaries and in none of the villages people can buy it in installments.

Irregularities

It came out in most of the FGDs 95.35 percent that the villagers had to pay more than the right price as fixed by the government. In Badaun and Kushinagar district in all the ration shops people have to pay more than the prescribed price while buying ration.

District	Number of villages where the community reported that they have to pay more than the right price for their food grains from PDS	
	Number	Percent
Badaun	10	100
Hardoi	13	92.86
Lalitpur	9	90
Kushinagar	9	100
Total	41	95.35

Findings and recommendations

The Public Distribution System is a very important scheme for a poverty stricken state like Uttar Pradesh. It was nice to see that all most all families in the villages surveyed have got one or the other types of card. However there are many critical gaps in the implementation of the scheme as well. The display of information in the ration shop is very poor. It was also found that all most all the people had to pay more than the prescribed price to get their entitled grain.

The priority should also be given to display of information on timing, price and quota of food grain at the FPS level. Public scrutiny of records relating to PDS is not allowed in most of the villages surveyed except one and no single functioning vigilance committee was found. It was also reported that only in 11% cases the beneficiaries are allowed to buy grain in installment which is also a clear violation of Supreme Court 's order

Recommendations

In the line of findings these are the few recommendations for improving PDS in the state.

1. The information like timing of opening of the Fair Price Shop, allocation, quota, pricings of food grain, list of ration card holder should be displayed at a public place on a priority basis.
2. The state government should strictly instruct the fair price shop owners to open the ration shop in all working days, ration should be distributed in prescribe rate and records should be maintained properly.
3. The food grain should be made available in installments by the ration dealer if asked by any beneficiaries.
4. The state government should take steps to constitute vigilance and monitoring committees for every fair price shop and it should be made functional for regular monitoring of ration shops. The details like list of ration card holders, monthly allocation, offtake and distribution of ration by the ration shop should be made available to the vigilance committee at regular basis.
5. All records and documents related to ration shop should be made available for public scrutiny as it will enhance transparency and help to reduce black marketing in the scheme.
6. The state government should investigate the issues of quality and irregularity in distribution food grain on a priority basis.

National Old Age Pension Scheme

Survey findings

Sample covered

The survey covered 10 villages in each of the four districts surveyed. Total 1025 person interviewed during the survey among them 527 were male and 498 were female. Those persons

above 65 years of age were only taken as sample during the process, as the Supreme Court orders pertain to only those above 65 years.

District	No. of Villages Covered	No. of eligible old persons visited			Age group of old persons	
		Male	Female	Total	60 – 65 years	> 65 years
Badaun	10	172	108	280	79	201
Hardoi	10	121	140	261	0	261
Lalitpur	10	187	215	402	0	402
Kushinagar	10	47	35	82	0	82
Total	40	527	498	1025	79	946

Coverage of old age pension

Out of the 946 eligible persons surveyed only 322 are getting the pension benefits which is 43.22 percent of the total eligible beneficiaries surveyed. Among which 121 are male and 210 were female.

District	Total no. of eligible old persons covered in survey	No. and % of eligible old persons receiving pension					
		Male		Female		Total	
		Number	Percent	Number	Percent	Number	Percent
Badaun	201	39	61	25	39	64	100
Hardoi	261	64	42.95	85	57.08	149	57.09
Lalitpur	402	51	32.08	108	67.92	159	39.55
Kushinagar	82	6	42.86	8	57.14	14	17.07
Total	946	160		226		386	

Highest numbers of beneficiaries were from Lalitpur district and lowest from Kushinagar district.

Amount of pension received

As per the survey all the beneficiaries were getting a sum of rupees 300 per month.

District	Less than 200 per month		200 to 300 per month		More than 300 but less than 400 per month		400 per month		More than 400 per month	
	No	%	No	%	No	%	No	%	No	%
Badaun	0	0	64	33	0	0	0	0	0	0
Hardoi	0	0	149	57.09	0		0		0	
Lalitpur	0	0	159	39.55	0	0	0	0	0	
Kushinagar	0	0	14	17.07	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total	0	0	386	43.22	0		0		0	

Last time pension was given

As per order of the Supreme Court the pension amount should be distributed in on or before 7th of every month.

However as per the survey, only one person in the state got pension in the month of survey.

Total 73 person got two month before and rest 248 beneficiaries got their entitled pension three

months before of the survey. The state government allocates pension once in a six month which

is clear violation of the Supreme Court's order.

District	Last month		Two months back		Three months back		More than three months back	
	No	%	No	%	No	%	No	%
Hardoi	1	0.67	0	0	0		148	99.3
Lalitpur	0	0	69	43.4	0		90	56.6
Kushinagar	0	0	4	28.57	0		10	71.43
Total	1		73		0		248	

Annapurna Scheme

District	Number of old persons who do not get old age pensions		No. of these who receive free grain currently		No. of these who do not receive free grain now but used to earlier	
	No	%	No	%*	No	%*
Badaun	137	24.46	0	0	0	0
Hardoi	112	20	0	0	0	0
Lalitpur	243	43.39	0	0	0	0
Kushinagar	68	12.14	0	0	0	0
Total	560	100	0	0	0	0

The Annapurna benefit was provided to the beneficiaries who are yet to get the benefits under the NOAP scheme. Under the scheme 10 kilograms of grain is provided free of cost to each beneficiary. Though total 560 eligible persons are yet to be covered under pension scheme but none of them are covered under the Annapurna Scheme.

Findings and recommendation

The national old age pension scheme has got already universalized for all the persons above 65 years of age and covered under below poverty line, however as the survey only 43 percent of the total eligible person are getting benefit under the scheme. The good thing about the state is that it also covering the individual above 60 years of age. The beneficiaries should be provided pension at least Rs 400 per month, in which central government pays 200 rupees and state should contribute equal matching grant, which is not happening in the state.

Recommendation

1. **Improve the coverage:** As seen in the survey less than half the eligible people are receiving pensions in the three districts surveyed. The reasons for this are many, with the most important one being inadequate allocations from the state in spite of expansion of the programme in 2007 to cover ALL old people who are above 65 years and from BPL households. An exercise must be conducted in all districts to assess the total number of eligible beneficiaries and allocations must then be made to ensure universal coverage of all eligible old people under the National Old Age Pension Scheme.
2. **Increase the pension amount:** In the state it is seen that the pension amount being paid

is only Rs. 300. The state government is not making only contributing Rs 100 per beneficiary per month. The state government should contribute an additional amount of Rs. 100 to ensure that at least Rs. 400 per month is paid to the beneficiaries.

3. **Regular and monthly distribution:** As per the order of the Supreme Court on dated 28th November 2001, payment of pension is to be made 7th of each month. However in Uttar Pradesh it is distributed once in a six month; which seer violation of courts order. The state government has to ensure regular and timely distribution of pension amount on 7th of every month; otherwise state government is liable to contempt of court.

National Family Benefit Scheme

Sample covered

As part of the survey 10 villages each from four districts were surveyed. The survey covered total 156 deceased families out of which 115 were male and rest 46 were female. Except 5 deceased from Badaun district rest were primary bread earners of the family before their death.

District	No. of Villages Covered	No. of eligible families covered			Sex of Deceased	
		Deceased was an "earning" member	Deceased was not an "earning" member	Total	Male	Female
Badaun	10	28	05	33	28	5
Hardoi	10	31	0	31	25	6
Lalitpur	10	80	0	80	49	31
Kushinagar	10	17	0	17	13	4
Total	40	156	5	161	115	46

Coverage under NFBS

District	No. of Families Covered	No. of eligible families who received benefit			No. of eligible families who received benefit under NFBS		
		When deceased was a male	When deceased was female	Total	Deceased was a married person	Deceased was not a married person	Total
Badaun	33	0	0	0	0	0	0
Hardoi	31	1	0	1	1	0	1
Lalitpur	80	8	0	8	8	0	8
Kushinagar	17	8	0	8	8	0	8
Total	161	17	0	17	17	0	17

Among 161 eligible families surveyed only 17 got their entitled benefits under the scheme. This is only less than 10 percent of the total eligible

beneficiaries surveyed. All the 17 deceased were married at the time of their death.

Time of payment

District	Number of eligible families who received NFBS	Timing of Payment					
		Within 4 weeks since death	1 to 3 months after death	4 to 6 months after death	7 months to one year after death	13 months to 5 years after death	More than 5 years after death
Badaun	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Hardoi	31	0	0	1	0	0	0
Lalitpur	80	1	2	1	0	4	0
Kushinagar	17	0	3	5	0	0	0
Total	128	1	5	7	0	4	0

As per the order of Supreme Court, the benefits should be paid within four week of the death. However; as per the survey only one family got benefit within the prescribed time period. Among rest of the families five got within three months, seven of them got within 4 to six months and rest of them got their entitled benefits within 13 months to five years.

Amount of payment

The findings of the survey shows all the 17 families who got the benefit, received onetime benefit of more than 10000 rupee or 20000 rupees.

Findings and Recommendations:

The death of any earning member in a poor family would have a high impact on the family and many times pushes the family further down to the margin of subsistence. Therefore, this scheme is the most significant in a sense that this is the only such support scheme which provides immediate help for the people living in poverty and destitution. It is also good find that the state government contributing additional 10000 rupees in the scheme.

However the survey shows that only 13.28% of the families got their entitlement. It was also reported that out of the people who got the benefits there were huge delays in most of the cases with nearly 25 percent of the families getting the benefit one year after the death. However in all the cases the family got the full amount. It was also observed from the FGDs very few families applied for the scheme due to low level of awareness among people over the scheme.

The following are some suggestions for effective implementation of the scheme:

1. The detailed provisions of the scheme should be pasted/displayed in public buildings such as Panchayat building, hospitals, block headquarters, anaganwadi centers etc to enhance the level of awareness among people over the scheme which abysmally low.
2. The state government should ensure timely disposal of money to the districts and strictly instruct the district collectors to disburse the money to the beneficiaries within a month.
3. The state government should take urgent steps to settle all the pending claims for the last few years.

National Maternity Benefit Scheme

Survey Details

For NMBS survey, all the women from BPL/Antodaya families who delivered in the last 12 month prior to survey were the sample. The team visited each and every household having a BPL or Antodaya card in the selected villages. In case of delivery in the last 12 month before the survey they were asked about the benefits they received other.

District	No. of Villages Covered	No. of eligible women covered			Age group of women	
		No. who had home delivery	No. who had hospital delivery	Total	< 19 years	> 19 years
Badaun	10	63	24	87	0	87
Hardoi	10	74	58	132	0	132
Lalitpur	10	122	135	257	1	256
Kushinagar	10	11	31	42	2	40
Total	40	270	248	518	3	515

Sample covered

The survey covered 10 villages each from 4 respective districts. Total 518 eligible women were interviewed during the process, among them 270 had home delivery and rest 248 had institutional delivery. Only 3 women interviewed were less than 19 years of age and rest 515 were above 19 years of age.

Coverage under NMBS/JSY

By place of delivery

As per the survey, out of 518 eligible women only 205 women received their entitled benefit under the scheme. Among the 205 beneficiaries 3 had home delivery and rest 202 had institutional delivery.

District	No. of eligible women covered	No. of eligible women who received monetary benefit		
		No. who had home delivery	No. who had hospital delivery	Total
Badaun	87	0	14	14
Hardoi	132	1	48	49
Lalitpur	257	2	124	126
Kushinagar	42	0	16	16
Total	518	3	202	205

By age

Among the 205 beneficiaries, three were less than 19 years of age and rest 202 were above 19 years of age.

District	No. of eligible women covered	No. of eligible women who received monetary benefit		
		< 19 years	> 19 years	Total
Badaun	87	0	14	14
Hardoi	132	0	49	49
Lalitpur	257	1	125	126
Kushinagar	42	2	14	16
Total	518	3	202	205

By number of children

As per the Supreme Court; number of children should not be a bar while providing

District	No. of eligible women covered	No. of eligible women who received monetary benefit		
		Less than 2 children	More than 2 children	Total
Badaun	87	03	11	14
Hardoi	132	28	21	49
Lalitpur	257	76	50	126
Kushinagar	42	7	9	16
Total	518	114	91	205

benefits under the scheme. The data shows that 114 beneficiaries had 2 or less than 2 children and rest 91 beneficiaries had more than 2 children.

Total amount received

Among the 205 beneficiary, 203 received a sum of 1400 after delivery and only two women got

District	Total amount received by women who had hospital delivery and received benefit		Total amount received by women who had home delivery and received benefit	
	< Rs. 1400	>=Rs. 1400	< Rs. 500	>=Rs. 500
Badaun	0	14	0	0
Hardoi	0	49	0	0
Lalitpur	0	124	0	2
Kushinagar	0	16	0	0
Total	0	203	0	2

a sum of rupees 500. It seems most of the beneficiary have received benefits under Janani Surakhya Yojna and NMBS is almost dysfunctional in the state.

ASHA worker from the village only.

Findings and Recommendations

As per the focus group discussion most of the payments were made through bank. It also came out from the discussions that payments were mostly made in the first week after delivery and the beneficiaries received the cheque mostly by the

The survey result shows that the National Maternity Benefit Scheme is almost none functional in the state as less than 2 percent eligible women got benefit under the scheme. Rest of the women got benefit under the JSY. The state government is of the opinion that the NMBS scheme has been phased out in spite of clear order of the Supreme Court that it can't be stopped without its permission. It is clear violation of courts order. In most of the villages people have no idea about the NMBS and even if they know they are not sure whom to approach. It means the government has not disseminated the information regarding the scheme as directed by the court.

Basing on the finding these are few recommendations for better functioning of the scheme:

1. The state government should regularize the NMBS abiding the Courts order. The benefits should be provided to all the pregnant women from the BPL families 8-12 weeks prior to the delivery irrespective of age and number of births.
2. The details of NMBS and JSY should be displayed in public places like ICDS centers, Panchayat buildings, Hospitals and also through other mediums. It will help the beneficiaries get an idea and understanding about both the schemes so that they can avail the benefits.
3. The state government should review the bottlenecks in the NMBS and ensure regular fund flow under the scheme.
4. The Village health committees should be made functional and have the rights to review the schemes and give feed backs to the officials.

MID DAY MEAL SCHEME

Sample covered under the study

To find out the status of implementation of the scheme the survey was carried out in total 40 villages, 10 villages each from district Badaun, Hardoi, Lalitpur, Kushinagar. Total 68 schools were covered out of which 12 were from Badaun, 18 from Hardoi, 22 from Kushinagar and 15 from Lalitpur totaling up to 67, these were government schools and 1 EGS school from Lalitpur was covered under the survey.

District	No of villages covered	No of schools covered				Total
		Government	Government assisted	EGS/AIE centers	Other	
Badaun	10	12	0	0	0	12
Hardoi	10	18	0	0	0	18
Lalitpur	10	22	0	1	0	23
Kushinagar	10	15	0	0	0	15
	40	67	0	1	0	68

The visits were conducted without giving the prior information, at the lunch time. The factors such as quality and quantity of hot cooked meal, cooking facilities, regularity of meals, hygiene, caste discrimination and social exclusion were examined. Discussions were held with children, cooks and teachers apart from FDGs with residents of the village.

Findings from the survey

The Supreme Court in its historical and most important order dated 28th November 2001 directed the State governments/Union territories to implement the mid-day meal scheme by providing every child in government and government assisted primary schools with a cooked mid day meal with a content of 300c calories and 8-12gms of protein each day of a school for a minimum of 200days.

Coverage

During the study out of 68 schools 54 (83.00%) were found to be serving mid day meal at the time of survey. In remaining 14 schools MDM was not served during the time of visit. The main reason given was that ration had not reached the school.

District	Number of schools	No of school where MDM is served on the day of the visit		No of FDG where community reported that hot cooked meal is served regularly in school	
Badaun	12	9	75.00	10	14.71
Hardoi	18	16	94.12	14	20.59
Lalitpur	23	16	76.19	9	13.24
Kushinagar	15	13	56.67	8	11.76
Total	68	54	83.00	41	60.29

But as survey was carried on with prior intimation to district authorities it was important to carry the reality check with residents of the villages covered during the survey. In discussion through FDG with residents it was found out that MDM was served regularly only in 41 (60.29) schools. That means large percentage of schools i.e. 40 % schools are violating the Supreme Court orders.

Facilities for MDM in the school

The Supreme Court issued an order on 20th April 2004 to improve the quality of MDM and to address various concerns raised in Commissioners' reports. Central government was directed to make provisions for construction of kitchen sheds and for better infrastructure and to improve facilities such as safe drinking water, plates and utensils.

District	No of schools	Drinking water		Cooking shed		Plates		Utensils	
		Number	Percent	Number	Percent	Number	Percent	Number	Percent
Badaun	12	11	91.6	11	91.6	5	41.6	12	100
Hardoi	18	15	83.3	15	83.3	0	0	17	94.4
Lalitpur	23	17	73.9	21	91.3	0	0	16	69.5
Kushinagar	15	14	93.3	12	80	2	13.3	11	73.3
Total	68	57	83.8	59	86.7	7	10.29	56	82.3

The survey found out that there is comparatively better performance in all the districts on facilities such as drinking water, cooking sheds and utensils for cooking but very poor performance for providing plates to children for eating the food. In district Hardoi and Lalitpur not a single school had provided plates to the children while in Kushinagar only 2 schools out of

15 schools covered during survey provided plates. In Badaun performance was slightly better as

5 out of 12 schools had provided plates. The school authorities were totally insensitive to this requirement. They voiced that it is perfectly alright for children to get their own plates from home and in one village in Hardoi tried to convince the survey team that getting their own plates from home is hygienic practice. So in most of the schools children carry plates in their school bag along with books and many villages they rush home to get a plate during lunch break.

The performance of district Lalitpur is worse and raises many questions about implementation of the programme. Out of 23 schools of district Lalitpur 6 did not have drinking water on premises, 2 schools were without cooking shade, all 23 schools did not provide plates and 7 did not have cooking utensils. It's a wonder that these schools are claiming to provide MDM and showing expenditure for the same and going scot free in spite of these violations.

Fuel used for cooking

District	No of schools	No. of schools where food is cooking in the school		LPG		Kerosene		Wood		Other	
		No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
Badaun	12	9	75	5	41.66	0	0	7	58.33	0	0
Hardoi	18	16	88.89	2	11.11	0	0	15	83.33	1	5.55
Lalitpur	23	16	69.57	3	13.04	0	0	14	60.86	4	17.39
Kushinagar	15	13	86.67	1	6.66	0	0	13	86.66	1	6.66
Total	68	54	79.41	11	16.17	0	0	49	72.05	6	8.82

In Uttar Pradesh cooking is primarily responsibility of cooks appointed by Gram Panchayat and cooking is outsourced only in those villages where pradhan have expressed their unwillingness to operate MDM scheme. The schools where -3 in Badaun,2 in Hardoi,7 in Lalitpur and 2 in Kushinagar is MDM is not cooked in the school are those where MDM is not implemented and here again performance of Lalitpur is worse. As we see from data wood is main fuel used for cooking and very few schools have facility of LPG. The schools which have facility of LPG complained about irregularity of supply. The other material mainly used is cow dung blocks where wood is expensive and not easily available.

Quality of food given

The Supreme Court in its April 2004 order states that attempts should be made for maintaining quality safeguards as also the improvement in the contents of the meal so as to provide nutritious meals to children.

District	No of schools	Quality of grains used in MDM				% schools where same menu is served everyday	% schools where eggs or fruits are given in MDM
		Good (%)	Fair (%)	Poor (%)	Not known (%)		
Badaun	12	0	12	0	0	4	0
Hardoi	18	0	10	4	4	0	0
Lalitpur	23	0	8	10	5	7	0
Kushinagar	15	0	13	1	0	1	0
Total	68	0	43	15	9	12	0

The Supreme Court in its order dated 28th November 2001, directs that every child in every government and government assisted school should be given a prepared MDM with a minimum content of 300 calories and 8-12 grams of protein each day. Due to civil society pressure and ongoing case in the Supreme Court, Central government increased the calorie norm from 300 to 450 calories and protein from 8 grams to 12 grams in August 2006. The children from higher secondary classes are entitled to 700 calories and 20 grams of protein.

As data clearly shows not a single school was able to provide good quality of nutritious food. Large no of schools (43) were providing fair quality of food and 15 were providing poor quality of food. Again here district Lalitpur shows worse performance where out of 23 schools 10 were providing poor quality and 8 fair quality and 7 were not providing food at all.

12 schools out of 68 were repeating menu instead of following order of different and varied menu every day. As per residents quality of cooked meals was average. Children felt that there should be more variety in the food, especially, where vegetables are concerned. They informed that only potatoes were served with lots of watery gravy. They wanted to have more green vegetables. Children also did not like sweet rice and wanted it to be removed from the menu as the cook only mixed rice and sugar in water and served it to kids.

They also complained that they get only 2 rotis and little vegetable. Children also complained that they are shouted down if they ask for second serving. In almost all the schools children reported that they do not get enough, sufficient quantity of food and have to go back home and eat. The study found that eggs and fruits are provided in any of the schools.

Regularity of supplies

In its historical order of 28th November 2001 the Honorable Supreme Court has directed that Mid Day Meal has to be provided for minimum 200 days in the year.

District	No of schools	Schools where grain reaches on time		SHGs/cooks are usually paid on time	
		Number	Percent	Number	Percent
Badaun	12	11	91.67	8	66.67
Hardoi	18	12	66.67	6	33.3
Lalitpur	23	9	39.13	6	26.09
Kushinagar	15	9	60	5	33.3
Total	68	41	60.29	25	36.76

As the data shows there is gross violation of Supreme Court order as grain reaches on time only in 41 schools out of 68 that means 40 % schools are not providing MDM regularly to children. Here again performance of district Lalitpur is worse than others where grain reaches regularly only in 9 schools (39%) out of 23 schools.

The flow of food grains is not smooth and residents reported in FDG that many times quotedar do not lift grain on time and grain is often diverted into market instead of schools.

The other reason affecting regularity of MDM is clear from survey. It is irregularity in payments to cooks. Only 36.7% cooks are paid regularly. Others complained that they get paid periodically and many a times it is partial amount. As these poor women are not paid regularly they have no other option but also to look for casual labour outside and as supply of grain is also not regular MDM is not cooked as per Supreme Court orders.

Cooks

In its order dated 20th April 2004 Supreme Court stated in appointments of cooks and helpers' preference should be given to dalits, Scheduled caste and Scheduled tribes.

In Uttar Pradesh cooks are appointed by Gram Panchayat through pradhan and responsibility is given to them and not to SHGs.

As we see in following table 80 % cooks are women. But here again Lalitpur district there are serious issues as 8 % are women cooks. In Kushinagar also only 50% cooks are women.

District	No of schools	Who has been given responsibility to cook?		% of female cooks*	% cooks from SC/ST communities*
		Cooks appointed by school	SHGs		

Badaun	12	12	100	92.3	23.07
Hardoi	18	18	100	78.2	21.73
Lalitpur	23	23	100	8.3	0
Kushinagar	15	15	100	50	22.22
Total	68	68	100	80.48	14.63

Though as per Supreme Court orders preference should be given to Scheduled castes and scheduled tribes only 14.6 % cooks are SC and or ST. This is a matter of concern as Uttar Pradesh has 30% SC and 0.1% ST population. In a State where SC population is sizable it is a matter of grave concern that only 14 % cooks belongs to that category. And this is a situation in a State which is headed by a party professing dalit ideology.

Lalitpur has huge Saharia population (SC) but not a single cook belongs to SC or ST. Kushinagar has large population of one of the most marginalized group of Mushahars community but only 22 % cooks belong to SC category. This is serious as teams found out that mainly marginalized communities send their children to government schools but their percentage in cooks is low.

Uttar Pradesh government had issued a GO after discussion with advisor and as suggested in the first review joint mission of government of India and Uttar Pradesh along with advisor to apply roster system suggested by Mandal commission for appointment of mid day meal cooks. This means first cook will be from SC and then common castes and then OBC (as per the requirement norms). But it's really sad that this GO was withdrawn after upper castes protested against appointment of SC cooks.

Caste discrimination

One of the key objectives of Mid Day Meal is to build egalitarian values, strengthen feelings of brotherhood and break the barriers of caste and religion.

District	No of schools	No. of schools where investigators found evidence of caste discrimination		No. of schools where community reported that children of all castes sit and eat together*	
		Number	Percent	Number	Percent
Badaun	12	1	8.33	9	90
Hardoi	18	4	22.22	9	64.29
Lalitpur	23	3	13.64	4	44.44
Kushinagar	15	0	0	8	100
Total	68	8	11.94	30	73.17

But as data shows survey teams found out evidence of caste based discrimination in 12 % of schools. But the percentage is higher as per residents as reported in FDG. Out of 68 schools 38 schools residents reported caste based discrimination. The practice of separating lower castes children from upper castes in sitting and other arrangements is very common. The school authorities not only behave roughly with lower castes children but expect them to do menial works. There are instances when serving food cooks make sure that no utensil is touched by lower castes children. In Lalitpur where only 4 schools children of both castes sit together it was reported by residents that Sahariya children are warned not to touch common hand pump used by upper castes but to rush to their basti for a drink.

Other aspects of MDM

Supervision

The Supreme Court in its order dated 17th October 2004 clarified that responsibility to monitor the implementation of MDM scheme essentially lies with the central government. But it has also directed that attempts should be made to closely monitor the programme so that nutritious meals are provided to the children.

District	No of schools	No. of schools where MDMS has been inspected by government official in the last one year	
		Number	Percent
Badaun	12	4	33.3
Hardoi	18	8	44.4
Lalitpur	23	8	36.36
Kushinagar	15	7	46.67
Total	68	27	40.3

The MDM authority formed at state level has formed task forces at state, district and block levels to constantly monitor the progress of the scheme. The district magistrates have been asked to take the corrective measures on reports of the inspecting officers. Village Education Committees (VEC) has been constituted. At village level it is a responsibility of VEC and gram sabha through pradhan to monitor the scheme.

As per the survey data only 40 % schools were inspected by officials. The laxity in supervision certainly affects the programme.

Hygiene

This is a very sensitive issue and there have been many instances in the past and present where children have reported ill after consuming MDM. But survey team did not find such instance in schools surveyed for this report. As per pradhans main reason in the past was cooking medium and mainly oil which was used to fry puries. There are strict orders in Uttar Pradesh not to serve puries for lunch.

District	No of schools	No. of schools where child fell ill after consuming MDM in the last 4 weeks	
		Number	Percent
Badaun	12	0	0
Hardoi	18	0	0
Lalitpur	23	0	0
Kushinagar	15	0	0
Total	68	0	0

Findings and recommendations

The overall performance of Mid Day Meal in Uttar Pradesh is far from satisfactory. The coverage is not yet complete as 40 % schools are still not serving MDM regularly. The facilities are not complete and there are serious issues about quality of food as none of the schools covered that is 68 schools were serving good quality of food. Children complained about insufficiency of food and 40 % schools are not regular in providing MDM. Caste based discrimination is a matter of grave concern as only 14 % cooks belong to SC category and as per residents 38 schools out of 68 reported caste based discrimination.

Recommendations

1. Arrangements have to be made to ensure that meals are served regularly in the schools. The survey found that there were large delays in the supply of grain to the schools because of which meals were being suspended. There were delays in supply of foodgrains in 40% of the schools. A system should be put in place to ensure that the foodgrains required for at least one month is available with the school at the beginning of each month.
2. The survey also found that there were delays in payments to the cooks and for the cooking costs. Only in 36% of the schools it was reported that payments are made in time. This also disrupts the meals. Arrangements should be made for cooking costs to be transferred in advance, so that there is no disruption in provision of meals for children.

3. Minimum infrastructural facilities for proper cooking and distribution of meal need to be provided in the schools, as 20% schools have no cooking sheds, only around 10% schools provide plates to the children and there are problems of lack of required utensils and proper drinking water facility.
4. The quality of meal should be improved as in 15% of the schools, it was reported that poor quality grain is being used for cooking of noon meal and in none of the schools did people feel that the quality was „good“ . The day wise menu should be fixed based upon the availability of vegetables and it should be prepared with the suggestion of parents teachers committee and all the children should know the menu. The distribution of egg/banana should be made mandatory at least thrice in a week. It will not only help in enhancing attendance rate of students, also the nutrition status of the children as well.
5. Rising prices of vegetables and dal has made the quality of the meal provided very poor. So inflation-indexed allocation as well as mobilization for kitchen garden in school premises should be encouraged.
6. As seen in the survey caste discrimination in the cooking and serving of the meal is still a serious problem in the state. The Supreme Court has clearly directed that priority should be given to cooks from SC/ST communities for the preparation of mid day meals. Serious action should be taken in the event of any form of social discrimination in mid-day meals, such as discrimination against Dalit children or Dalit cooks. Priority should be given to cooks and helpers of Dalit or Tribal communities. The Government must take a strong stand against any opposition to appointment of cooks from backward and dalit communities and ensure that priority is given to these communities in the appointment of cooks.
7. Information on stock, provision of the schemes etc to be displayed in the schools premises.

List of villages

List district/Development Block/Village Panchayat and Hamlet is as follows:-

SI No.	Name of District	Name of Block	Name of Village	Name of Hamlet
1	Badaun	Rapura	Rampur Mohkam	Rampur Mohkam
2			Mutukpur	Mutukpur
3			Sikandarpur Khagi	Sikandarpur Khagi
4			Bhaiyapur	Bhaiyapur
5			Bhagta Nala	Bhagta Nala
6		Jagat	Nai	Nai
7			Budhwai	Budhwai
8			Kharkholi Burd	Kharkholi Burd
9			Rupapur	Rupapur
10			Kathara Khagai	Kathara Khagai
11	Hardoi	Behadar	Jakhu	Jakhu
12			Auramau	Auramau
13			Kutubpur	Kutubpur
14			Kutubpur	Kutubpur Sarsand
15			Akbarpur	Akbarpur Talhu
16			Shahpur	Shahpur Chamraha
17		Pihani	Meethi Newada	Meethi Newada
18			Uchval Nigawan	Uchval Nigawan
19			Delpandarwa	Delpandarwa
20			Rajuapur	Rajuapur

21			Darra	Darra Bukharpur
22	Kushinagar	Padrauna	Jangal Khirkiya	Jangal Khirkiya
23			Baldeeha	Baldeeha
24			Dharampur Khurd	Dharampur Khurd
25		Duddhi	Loharpatti	Loharpatti
26			Mathiya Mafi	Mathiya Mafi
27			Mathiya Mafi	Mathiya Mafi
28			Narwadeeh	Mela Narahwa
29			Ganeshpatti	Gagalwa
30			Shahpur	Shahpur Uchkipati
31	Lalitpur	Mehraoni	Sadkara	Sadkara
32			Mainwar	Mainwar
33			Bhaudi	Bhaudi
34			Chaprat	Chaprat
35			Chapchaul	Chapchaul
36		Jakhaura	Mailar	Mailar
37			Seeron Khurd	Seeron Khurd
38			Adhiyari	Adhiyari
39			Khandera	Khandera
40			Ghorpur	Ghorpur